

## **Decisions of the Planning Committee B**

30 March 2022

Members Present:-

Councillor Golnar Bokaei (Chairman)  
Councillor Melvin Cohen (Vice-Chairman)

Councillor Ammar Naqvi                      Councillor Nicole Richer  
Councillor Roberto Weeden-      Councillor Anne Hutton  
Sanz

Apologies for Absence

Councillor Reema Patel                      Councillor Alan Schneiderman

### **1. MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING**

**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting held on 15 February 2022 be agreed as a correct record.

### **2. ABSENCE OF MEMBERS**

Apologies were received from Councillor Schneiderman who was substituted by Councillor Hutton.

Apologies were received from Councillor Patel.

### **3. DECLARATION OF MEMBERS' DISCLOSABLE PECUNIARY INTERESTS AND OTHER INTERESTS (IF ANY)**

The Chairman advised that she had made an objection in relation to item 6 on the agenda, Land adjacent to the National Grid Sub-station Partingdale Lane in her capacity as Ward Councillor. The Chairman would therefore not be taking part in the discussion or voting on the item.

Councillor Melvin Cohen declared an interest in relation to item 8 Dental Surgery 150 Broadfields Avenue, by virtue of it being his dentist and the practice being located close to his home address.

Councillor Naqvi declared an interest in relation to item 8 Dental Surgery 150 Broadfields Avenue, by virtue of the practice being located close to his home address.

### **4. REPORT OF THE MONITORING OFFICE (IF ANY)**

None.

## 5. ADDENDUM (IF APPLICABLE)

Items contained within the addendum were dealt with under individual agenda items. The Committee noted the addendum to the Planning Agenda which was published and circulated prior to the meeting.

## 6. LAND ADJACENT TO THE NATIONAL GRID SUB-STATION PARTINGDALE LANE LONDON NW7 1NS - 20/4241/FUL - MILL HILL

The Chairman declared that she would be leaving the room and not voting on the item, due to having expressed an objection to the application in her capacity as a Ward Councillor. The Chairman handed over chairing of the item to the Vice-Chairman, Councillor Cohen.

The report was introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received verbal representations from Mr Temple, Mr Selby, Councillor Hart, Councillor Duschinsky, Councillor Simberg, Councillor Richard Cornelius and Mr Offord in objection to the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the agent to the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officer recommendation to approve the application subject to conditions as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 0

Against (Approval): 5

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application not be approved.**

The Chairman, seconded by Councillor Richer moved a motion to refuse the application for the following reasons:

- The proposed development would constitute inappropriate development within designated Metropolitan Green Belt land and very special circumstances do not exist such as to outweigh the harm to the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness. As such, the proposed development conflicts with Paragraphs 147 to 151 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021), Policy G2 of the London Plan (2021), Policy CS7 of the Barnet Core Strategy (2012) and Policy DM15 of the Barnet Development Management Policies (2012).

The reasons for refusal were unanimously agreed by the committee.

Votes on the motion to refuse for the reason outlined above were recorded as follows:

For (Refusal): 5

Against (Refusal): 0

Abstention: 0

- **RESOLVED that the application be REFUSED as the proposed development would constitute inappropriate development within designated Metropolitan**

**Green Belt land and very special circumstances do not exist such as to outweigh the harm to the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness. As such, the proposed development conflicts with Paragraphs 147 to 151 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021), Policy G2 of the London Plan (2021), Policy CS7 of the Barnet Core Strategy (2012) and Policy DM15 of the Barnet Development Management Policies (2012).**

**7. 38-44 BALLARDS LANE LONDON N3 2BJ - 21/4977/FUL - WEST FINCHLEY**

The Chairman, Councillor Bokaei, re-joined the meeting and chaired the remainder of the items on the agenda.

The report and addendum were introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received verbal representations from Mr Razvi and Councillor Houston, in objection to the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to approve the application subject to conditions as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 4

Against (Approval): 2

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application be approved subject to conditions and obligations secured by a legal agreement under section 106 under the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (and other powers) as set out in the report and addendum AND that the Committee also grants delegated authority to the Service Director of Planning and Building Control or the Head of Development Management to make any minor alterations, additions or deletions to the recommended conditions/obligations or reasons for refusal as set out in this report and addendum provided this authority shall be exercised after consultation with the Chairman (or in their absence the Vice-Chairman) of the Committee (who may request that such alterations, additions or deletions be first approved by the Committee).**

**8. DENTAL SURGERY 150 BROADFIELDS AVENUE EDGWARE HA8 8SS - 21/6150/FUL - EDGWARE**

Councillor Melvin Cohen declared an interest in the item and therefore decided to leave the room during the discussion and voting of the item.

The report and addendum were introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received verbal representations from Mr Shaffer and Mr Saffery in support of the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to refuse the application as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 1

Against (Approval): 4

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application not be refused.**

The Chairman, seconded by Councillor Richer moved to approve the application for the following reasons:

- The establishment would be used as a health facility.
- The loss of the residential use and the rear cabin extension was outweighed by the benefit of expanding the service and members felt this adequately demonstrated the benefits of the scheme.
- Members did not consider that the retention of the cladding would be unduly incongruous, or that the proposed use and associated air conditioning units would have an unacceptable impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring occupiers.

The committee unanimously agreed the reasons for approval.

Votes on approval of the application for the reasons outlined above were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 4

Against (Approval): 1

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application be approved subject to conditions, for the following reasons:**

- **The establishment would be used as a health facility.**
- **The loss of the residential use and the rear cabin extension was outweighed by the benefit of expanding the service and members felt this adequately demonstrated the benefits of the scheme.**
- **Members did not consider that the retention of the cladding would be unduly incongruous, or that the proposed use and associated air conditioning units would have an unacceptable impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring occupiers.**

## **9. 133 BRENT STREET LONDON NW4 4DA - 21/4966/FUL - HENDON**

The report was introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received a verbal representation from Mr Falk in objection to the application. The Committee received a verbal representation from Mr Bishop and Councillor Shooter in support of the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, Councillor Cohen, seconded by Councillor Hutton moved a motion to defer the application. The Committee were minded to approve the application, but wished to have more time to consider robust reasons. Due to the next committee meeting taking place after the elections and therefore being constituted of new Members, if deferred, the application would be required to be re-heard in its entirety.

Votes on the motion to defer the application for the reasons outlined above, were recorded as follows:

For (deferral): 4

Against (deferral): 2

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application be deferred to a future meeting.**

**10. 19 ESMER CRESCENT LONDON NW9 7BL - 21/6135/HSE - WEST HENDON**

The report was introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received a verbal representation from Councillor Richman in support of the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to refuse the application as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Refusal): 5

Against (Refusal): 1

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application is REFUSED as per the reasons outlined in the officer's report AND the Committee grants delegated authority to the Service Director – Planning and Building Control to make any minor alterations, additions or deletions to the recommended conditions/obligations or reasons for refusal as set out in this report and addendum provided this authority shall be exercised after consultation with the Chairman (or in their absence the Vice- Chairman) of the Committee (who may request that such alterations, additions or deletions be first approved by the Committee).**

**11. REAR OF 184 BURNT OAK BROADWAY EDGWARE HA8 0AS - 21/4174/OUT - BURNT OAK**

The report and addendum were introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to refuse the application as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 5

Against (Approval): 1

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application be APPROVED subject to conditions as set out in the report and addendum AND the Committee grants delegated authority to the Service Director – Planning and Building Control to make any minor alterations, additions or deletions to the recommended conditions/obligations or reasons for refusal as set out in this report and addendum provided this authority shall be exercised after consultation with the Chairman (or in their absence the Vice-Chairman) of the Committee (who may request that such alterations, additions or deletions be first approved by the Committee).**

**12. RAILWAY ARCHES COLINDEEP LANE LONDON NW9 6HD - 21/3264/RCU - COLINDALE**

The report was introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to approve the application as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 6

Against (Approval): 0

Abstention: 0

**RESOLVED that the application be APPROVED subject to conditions as set out in the report and addendum AND the Committee grants delegated authority to the Service Director – Planning and Building Control to make any minor alterations, additions or deletions to the recommended conditions/obligations or reasons for refusal as set out in this report and addendum provided this authority shall be exercised after consultation with the Chairman (or in their absence the Vice-Chairman) of the Committee (who may request that such alterations, additions or deletions be first approved by the Committee).**

**13. 1 ALBERT ROAD BARNET EN4 9SH - 21/5554/FUL - EAST BARNET**

The report and addendum were introduced, and slides presented by the Planning Officer.

The Committee received verbal representations from Mr Dix in objection to the application.

The Committee received verbal representations from the agent of the Applicant.

The Committee had the opportunity to ask questions of the speaker and officers.

Following discussions, the Committee voted on the Officers recommendation to approve the application subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

Votes were recorded as follows:

For (Approval): 1

Against (Approval): 3

Abstention: 2

**RESOLVED that the application not be approved.**

Councillor Richer, seconded by Councillor Hutton moved the motion to refuse the application for the following reasons:

- **The development would fail to provide adequate private or communal amenity space for 7no of proposed units, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers and contrary to Policy DM02 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012), Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (2016) and the Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016).**
- **The proposed integrated communal play and amenity space, by virtue of its siting and design, would result in a sub-standard environment through exposure to unacceptable noise and poor air quality, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers and contrary to Policies D6, D14 and S4 of the London Plan (2021), Policy DM02 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012), Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (2016) and the Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016).**
- **Insufficient information has been submitted to demonstrate that the proposed units would not be exposed to the risk of overheating, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers, and that the units would adequately ventilated without adverse impact on the urban heat island from an over reliance on energy intensive mechanical cooling systems, contrary to Policies D3, D6 and SI 4 of the London Plan (2021), Policies CS4 & CS13 of the Local Plan: Core Strategy (2012) and Policies DM01, DM02 & DM04 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012).**

The committee unanimously agreed the reasons for refusal.

Votes on refusal of the application for the reasons outlined below were recorded as follows:

For (Refusal): 3

Against (Refusal): 0

Abstention: 3

**RESOLVED that the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:**

- **The development would fail to provide adequate private or communal amenity space for 7no of proposed units, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers and contrary to Policy DM02 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012), Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (2016) and the Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016).**

- The proposed integrated communal play and amenity space, by virtue of its siting and design, would result in a sub-standard environment through exposure to unacceptable noise and poor air quality, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers and contrary to Policies D6, D14 and S4 of the London Plan (2021), Policy DM02 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012), Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (2016) and the Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016).
- Insufficient information has been submitted to demonstrate that the proposed units would not be exposed to the risk of overheating, to the detriment of the residential amenity of future occupiers, and that the units would adequately ventilated without adverse impact on the urban heat island from an over reliance on energy intensive mechanical cooling systems, contrary to Policies D3, D6 and SI 4 of the London Plan (2021), Policies CS4 & CS13 of the Local Plan: Core Strategy (2012) and Policies DM01, DM02 & DM04 of the Local Plan: Development Management Document (2012).

#### **14. ANY ITEM(S) THAT THE CHAIRMAN DECIDES ARE URGENT**

The Vice-Chairman thanked the Chairman and officers for their hard work on the committee.

The Chairman thanked all the committee Members.

The meeting finished at 10.10pm.